

**EXHIBIT  
B**

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
DISTRICT OF MINNESOTA**

~~IN RE PORK ANTITRUST~~

~~Civil No. 18-cv-1776 (JRT/HB)~~

~~This Document Relates To:~~

~~**DEFENDANT TRIUMPH FOODS,  
LLC'S ANSWER TO DIRECT ACTION  
PLAINTIFFS' CONSOLIDATED  
COMPLAINT**~~

~~**ALL ACTIONS BROUGHT BY  
DIRECT ACTION PLAINTIFFS**~~

~~**JURY TRIAL DEMANDED**~~

IN RE PORK ANTITRUST LITIGATION

Civil No. 18-cv-1776 (JRT/JFD)

This Document Relates To:

**DEFENDANT TRIUMPH FOODS,  
LLC'S AMENDED ANSWER TO  
DIRECT ACTION PLAINTIFFS'  
CONSOLIDATED COMPLAINT**

**ALL ACTIONS BROUGHT BY DIRECT  
ACTION PLAINTIFFS**

**JURY TRIAL DEMANDED**

Defendant Triumph Foods, LLC (“Triumph”), by and through its undersigned counsel, respectfully submits its Amended Answer to the Direct Action Plaintiffs’ (“DAPs”) Consolidated Complaint, Dkt. 1659 (“Complaint”):<sup>1</sup>

**I. INTRODUCTION<sup>2</sup>**

Triumph states that the first paragraph of the Introduction contains recitations of the Court’s orders and instructions that require no response; to the extent a response is required, Triumph states that the Court’s orders and instructions speak for themselves and denies any language to the contrary contained in this paragraph. Footnote 1 of the

Complaint defines “Plaintiffs” and requires no response. The second and third paragraphs of the Introduction contain legal assertions that require no response; to the extent a response is required, Triumph states that the U.S. Code, the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, and the rules and procedures of the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation speak for themselves and govern the DAPs’

<sup>1</sup> “DAPs” refers collectively to each of the named plaintiffs identified in ¶¶ 23-80 of this Complaint.

<sup>2</sup> Triumph includes the headings from DAPs’ Complaint in its Answer for convenience only and does not construe them, and does not believe they are intended to be construed, as allegations necessitating a response. To the extent they are intended as allegations, they are denied.

procedural rights with respect to this case. Footnote 2 of the Complaint contains legal assertions that require no response; to the extent a response is required, Triumph states that the case law cited therein speaks for itself and Triumph denies any assertion contrary to or unsupported by those cases. The fourth paragraph of the Introduction contains descriptive language of the Complaint that requires no response.

## **II. CHART OF DIRECT ACTION PLAINTIFFS, DEFENDANTS AND CAUSES OF ACTION**

Triumph states that the “Chart of Direct Action Plaintiffs, Defendants and Causes of Action” contains no substantive allegations and requires no response.

## **III. NATURE OF ACTION**

1. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph states that Footnote 3 attempts to define “pork” to include various things including “processed products and by-products.” Triumph denies that DAPs may so define the term “pork” for reasons set forth by the Court. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph or in Footnote 2 and therefore denies the same.

2. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

3. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

4. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

5. Triumph admits that it was a participant in certain of Agri Stats' products for a certain period of time. Triumph denies the remaining allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

6. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

7. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

8. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

9. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

10. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph states that Footnote 4 contains Plaintiffs' definition of the word "conspiracy" and requires no response; however, Triumph denies that it has engaged in any "conduct actionable under the causes of action asserted against Defendants." Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

11. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

12. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

13. This paragraph contains legal conclusions such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

14. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

15. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

16. Triumph denies that Plaintiffs state a claim and/or are entitled to any of the relief requested or otherwise. Triumph denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

17. Triumph denies that Plaintiffs state a claim and/or are entitled to any of the relief requested or otherwise. Triumph denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

#### **IV. JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

18. Triumph denies that Plaintiffs state a claim and/or are entitled to any of the relief requested or otherwise. Triumph denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

19. Triumph does not dispute that this Court has subject matter jurisdiction in this matter. Triumph denies any other allegations in this Paragraph.

20. Triumph does not dispute that venue is appropriate in this District. Triumph denies any remaining allegations in this Paragraph.

21. Triumph does not dispute that this Court has personal jurisdiction over Triumph in this matter. Triumph denies any other allegations in this Paragraph.

22. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

## V. PARTIES

### A. Plaintiff Groups<sup>3</sup>

23-80. In response to Paragraphs 23 – 80, Triumph denies that any of the DAPs “sustained injury and damage as a proximate result of the antitrust violations alleged in this Complaint” as each DAP uniformly alleges. Triumph denies that any antitrust violations have been committed or that DAPs have sufficiently stated a claim. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

81. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs’ general characterizations of their claims, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

---

<sup>3</sup> Listed by monikers used to identify groups of DAPs in this Complaint.

## **B. Defendants**

### **(1) Agri Stats**

82. Triumph admits that it was a participant in certain Agri Stats products for certain years of the “Conspiracy Period” and provided Agri Stats with certain information as a participant. Triumph denies all remaining allegations in this Paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

83. Triumph denies all allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

### **(2) Clemens**

84. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

85. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

86. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

### **(3) Hormel**

87. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

88. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

89. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

**(4) JBS**

90. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

**(5) Seaboard**

91. Triumph denies all allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

**(6) Smithfield**

92. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

**(7) Triumph**

93. Triumph admits that it is an LLC with a principal place of business in St. Joseph, Missouri. Triumph admits that it was a participant in certain Agri Stats reports until approximately 2017, and it provided Agri Stats with certain information as a participant. Triumph denies the remaining allegations in this paragraph.

**(8) Tyson**

94. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

95. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.



96. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

97. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

98. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

## **VI. CO-CONSPIRATORS**

99. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

100. Triumph admits that Daily's Premium Meats, LLC is a Delaware LLC headquartered in Kansas City, Missouri. Triumph admits that it has held a 50% non-majority interest in Daily's Premium Meats since approximately September 2014. Triumph admits that since September 2014, Seaboard and Triumph have each held (directly or indirectly) a 50% interest in Daily's and that as of September 2014, Daily's board of directors was made up of four directors appointed by Seaboard, consisting of Seaboard or Seaboard Corporation employees, and four directors appointed by Triumph, consisting of employees of Triumph or employees of LLC members of Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

101. Triumph admits that it owns a non-majority 50% interest in Seaboard Triumph Foods, which is an LLC headquartered in Sioux City, Iowa. Triumph denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

102. Triumph denies the allegations of this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

103. Triumph denies the allegations of this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

## **VII. TRADE AND COMMERCE**

104. Triumph denies the allegations of this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

105. Triumph denies the allegations of this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

## **VIII. THE IMPORTANCE OF AGRI STATS TO THE UNLAWFUL CONSPIRACY ALLEGED IN THIS COMPLAINT**

106. Triumph denies the allegations of this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

### **A. Agri Stats Markets its Collusive Scheme to Pork Producers**

107. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

108. Triumph admits that it was a participant in certain Agri Stats reports until approximately January 2017, and that it provided certain information to Agri Stats as a participant. Triumph denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph

is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

109. Triumph denies the allegations of this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

110. Triumph states that the cited source is the best evidence of its contents and denies any allegation inconsistent therewith. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

111. Triumph states that the cited source is the best evidence of its contents and denies any allegation inconsistent therewith. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

112. Triumph states that the cited source is the best evidence of its contents and denies any allegation inconsistent therewith. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

113. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without knowledge sufficient to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies same.

114. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph regarding Triumph, and Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

**B. Agri Stats Knowingly Provided Packer/Processor Defendants and Co-Conspirators With the Ability to Monitor and Enforce Their Collective Restriction of the Pork Supply, and to Discipline Co-Conspirators For Not Complying With the Conspiracy**

115. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph regarding Triumph, and Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

116. Triumph states that the alleged but uncited communications quoted or referenced in this paragraph speak for themselves and are the best evidence of their contents, to the extent they exist, and Triumph denies any allegations herein that are inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

117. Triumph admits that it participated in certain Agri Stats reports at certain times, and provided certain information to Agri Stats as a participant. Triumph denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph states that the cited source is the best evidence of its contents and denies all allegations in this paragraph inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

118. Triumph states that the cited source is the best evidence of its contents and denies all allegations in this paragraph inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

119. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

120. Triumph states that the cited source is the best evidence of its contents and denies all allegations in this paragraph inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph denies all allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

121. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

122. Triumph states that the cited source is the best evidence of its contents and denies all allegations in this paragraph inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

123. Triumph denies all allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

124. Triumph states that the cited source is the best evidence of its contents and denies all allegations in this paragraph inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

125. Triumph states that the cited source is the best evidence of its contents and denies all allegations in this paragraph inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph denies all allegations in this paragraph.

126. Triumph states that the cited source is the best evidence of its contents and denies all allegations in this paragraph inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph denies all

allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

127. Triumph states that the cited source is the best evidence of its contents and denies all allegations in this paragraph inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

128. Triumph admits that certain Agri Stats employees periodically met with Triumph employees. Triumph denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

129. Triumph admits that certain Agri Stats employees periodically met with Triumph employees. Triumph denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

130. Triumph states that the cited source is the best evidence of its contents and denies all allegations in this paragraph inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

131. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

132. Triumph states that the cited source is the best evidence of its contents and denies all allegations in this paragraph inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph lacks

sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

133. Triumph denies all allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

134. Triumph denies all allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

135. Triumph admits that it was a participant in certain Agri Stats studies until approximately January 2017. Triumph states that the “books” referred to herein are the best evidence of their contents and denies all allegations in this paragraph inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph denies all remaining allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

136. Triumph denies all allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

137. Triumph denies all allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

138. Triumph states that any quoted or screen-shot sources (some cited here, some not) are the best evidence of their contents and Triumph denies any allegations inconsistent or out of

context therewith. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

139. Triumph states that the sources referred to in this paragraph are the best evidence of their contents and Triumph denies any allegations inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

140. Triumph states that any quoted or screen-shot sources (not cited here) are the best evidence of their contents and Triumph denies any allegations inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

141. Triumph states that whatever emails are referenced in this paragraph are the best evidence of their contents, and Triumph denies any allegations inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph is without sufficient information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

142. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph regarding Seaboard and therefore denies the same. Triumph admits that there is a June 7, 2013 email from Rick Hoffman in which this quote appears along with several other statements and text. Triumph states that this email speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents, and denies all allegations inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph denies all remaining allegations in this paragraph, and specifically denies that the spreadsheet referenced in the email identified in this paragraph identifies, or even speculates as to, any of Triumph's competitors. Deposition of Ricci (Rick) Hoffman (April 26, 2022), 121:2- 124:1.



143. Triumph first states that the heading in Figure 5, “A Partially De-Anonymized Agri Stats Report (Triumph),” is only that – a DAP-invented heading – and does not appear in any document referenced herein; Triumph denies DAPs’ characterization of the document referenced. Triumph admits that the document with beginning bates label SBF0459029 is a February 11, 2015 email from Matt—not “Max”—England to employees of Triumph and Seaboard with the subject “RE: Margin Management Meeting.” Triumph admits that Mr. England’s email attached a document that contains multiple tables (more than two as alleged). Triumph states that the email and attached document referenced in this paragraph speak for themselves and are the best evidence of their contents, and Triumph denies all allegations inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph admits that the tables identified Triumph’s and Seaboard’s processing plants. Triumph denies all remaining allegations in this paragraph. *See, e.g.*, SBF0459029 (“Note – the parenthetical assignment of plant names is purely my guesswork

... I could be wrong on the assignments.”); England Dep. Tr. at 150:11-19 (“So the Agri Stats reports would have listed the participants in the report, and for the reports that I believe Triumph and Seaboard received, Triumph and Seaboard would have been identified, but otherwise, these would be guesses. And to be totally transparent, you probably know better than I do whether they are even right.”).

144. Triumph admits that there is a May 13, 2015 email from Matt England to Gary Louis (SBF0490482) that contains the quoted statement in addition to many other statements and text. Triumph states that this email speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents and denies all allegations inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph admits that certain of its employees created summaries that included, but were not limited to, Agri Stats data at certain points in time and sometimes shared these summaries with certain employees at

Seaboard.

Triumph denies that any of these summaries “deanonymized” participants in Agri Stats reports.

Triumph denies all remaining allegations in this paragraph.

145. Triumph states that the alleged analysis referenced in this paragraph speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

146. Triumph states that any quoted or screen-shot sources (some cited here, some not) are the best evidence of their contents and Triumph denies any allegations inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

147. Triumph states that any quoted sources (none cited here) are the best evidence of their contents and Triumph denies any allegations inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph denies all allegations herein as to Triumph. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

148. Triumph states that any referenced sources (none cited here) are the best evidence of their contents and Triumph denies any allegations inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

149. Triumph denies any allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

150. Triumph denies any allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

151. Triumph is without information sufficient to admit or deny Plaintiffs' general, uncited description of "economic theory" and denies same. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

152. Triumph states that the alleged testimony referenced in this paragraph speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

153. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

154. Triumph states that the alleged declaration referenced in this paragraph speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

155. Triumph states that the quoted source is the best evidence of its contents and Triumph denies any allegations inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph denies all allegations herein as to Triumph. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

156. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

**IX. THE MARKET FOR THE PRODUCTION AND SUPPLY OF PORK WAS CONDUCTIVE TO COLLUSION**

157. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

A. **Pork is a Commodity Product With Inelastic Demand**

158. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

159. Triumph states that the sources cited here are the best evidence of their contents and Triumph denies any allegations inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph denies all allegations herein as to Triumph. Triumph denies all remaining allegations of this paragraph.

160. Triumph states that the cited source is the best evidence of its contents and Triumph denies any allegations inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph denies all allegations herein as to Triumph. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

161. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' general characterizations of their claims, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

B. **The Packer/Processor Defendants and Co-Conspirators Controlled the Supply of Pork in the United States, Which Allowed the Conspiracy to Succeed**

162. Triumph states that the website referenced in this paragraph speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

163. Triumph denies all allegations herein as to Triumph. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

164. Triumph denies all allegations herein as to Triumph. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

165. Triumph states that the cited source in this paragraph is the best evidence of its contents and Triumph denies any allegations inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph denies all allegations herein as to Triumph. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

166. Triumph denies the last sentence of this paragraph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph, which are generalized, and therefore denies the same.

167. Triumph denies all allegations in this paragraph or the figures and sources related to or as to Triumph, including but not limited to the statement in Figure 8 that Triumph is accurately listed as a “Farrow-Feeder, Feeder-Finish” or the implication that Triumph is in any way a hog producer. Triumph otherwise is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph, and therefore denies the same.

168. Triumph states that the cited source in this paragraph is the best evidence of its contents and Triumph denies any allegations inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

169. Triumph states that the public filings referenced in this paragraph speak for themselves and are the best evidence of their contents. Triumph admits that Seaboard sold pork that was produced in Triumph’s plant. Triumph denies all other allegations in this paragraph as

to Triumph. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

170. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

171. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

172. Triumph admits that its LLC members include or have included Christensen Farms, The Hanor Company, New Fashion Pork, TriOak Foods, Eichelberger Farms, and Allied Producers Cooperative. Triumph denies the remaining allegations in this paragraph.

173. Triumph states that the alleged public filing referenced in this paragraph speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

174. Triumph states that the alleged public filings referenced in this paragraph speaks for themselves and are the best evidence of their contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

175. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

176. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph insofar as they pertain to Triumph, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

177. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph insofar as they pertain to Triumph, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

178. Triumph denies the last sentence of this paragraph. Triumph denies that it sells pork products. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

**C. The Market For the Production and Sale of Pork Was Concentrated**

179. Triumph denies the first sentence of this paragraph. Triumph does not understand the confusingly worded third sentence of this paragraph, but to the extent it alleges the existence of a conspiracy or Triumph's involvement therein, it is denied. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

180. Triumph denies all allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph, and therefore denies the same.

181. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph or Figure 9, and therefore denies the same.

182. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

183. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

184. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.



185. Triumph admits that it is a 50% owner of Seaboard Triumph Foods, which operates a processing plant that opened in 2017. Triumph denies all other allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

186. Triumph is unaware as to the meaning of “Market Share” and therefore lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny this allegation, and thus denies same. Triumph denies all other allegations in this paragraph or Figure 11 as to Triumph. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

187. Triumph denies the first and third sentences of this paragraph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

188. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

189. The quoted source is the best evidence of its contents and Triumph denies all allegations herein inconsistent or out of context therewith. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

190. Triumph notes that Figure 12 appears to represent that Triumph had “slaughter capacity” in 2005, the year before Triumph began operations in 2006, which is absurd. Triumph denies all allegations as to Triumph in this paragraph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

**D. There Were Barriers to Entry in the Market For Packing And Processing**

191. Triumph admits that Seaboard Triumph Foods' processing plant cost approximately \$330 million to launch. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

**X. SELECT TRADE ASSOCIATIONS FACILITATED COLLUSION**

192. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without information or knowledge sufficient to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

193. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph as to Triumph. Triumph is without information or knowledge sufficient to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies same.

194. Triumph states that the alleged website referenced in this paragraph speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

195. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

196. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

197. Triumph states that the alleged website referenced in this paragraph speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

198. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

199. Triumph states that the websites referenced in this paragraph speak for themselves and are the best evidence of their contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

200. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

201. Triumph states that the alleged agenda referenced in this paragraph speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

202. Triumph states that the alleged website referenced in this paragraph speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

203. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations regarding statements made by Smithfield CEO Larry Pope and therefore denies the same. Triumph denies the remaining allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies same.

204. Triumph states that the alleged testimony and article referenced in this paragraph speak for themselves and are the best evidence of their contents. Triumph denies the allegations

in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

205. Triumph states that the letter referenced in this paragraph speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

206. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

207. Triumph states that the alleged website referenced in this paragraph speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

208. Triumph states that the alleged website referenced in this paragraph speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

209. Triumph admits that it has been a member of AMI and then NAMI and, that Mark Campbell and Rick Hoffman have served on the Boards of Directors of AMI and/or NAMI, but Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

210. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

211. Triumph states that the alleged website referenced in this paragraph speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient

knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

212. Triumph states that the alleged presentations referenced in this paragraph speak for themselves and are the best evidence of their contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

213. Triumph states that the alleged presentations referenced in this paragraph speak for themselves and are the best evidence of their contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

214. Triumph states that the alleged website referenced in this paragraph speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

215. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

216. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

217. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

218. Triumph states that the alleged promotional materials referenced in this paragraph speak for themselves and are the best evidence of their contents, and Triumph is otherwise

without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

**XI. DEFENDANTS AND CO-CONSPIRATORS IMPLEMENTED COLLUSIVE ANTICOMPETITIVE CAPACITY AND PROCESSING RESTRICTIONS**

**A. Overview of the Restriction of the Pork Supply During the Conspiracy**

219. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' general characterizations of their claims, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

220. Triumph states that the article quoted herein is the best evidence of its contents and denies allegations to the contrary. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

221. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

222. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph and Figure 13 pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

223. Triumph states that the alleged article referenced in this paragraph speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

224. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

225. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph and Figure 14 pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

226. Triumph states that the alleged documents referenced in this paragraph and footnote speak for themselves and are the best evidence of their contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

227. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

228. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

229. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

230. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

**(1) Smithfield**

231. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

232. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

233. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

234. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

235. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

236. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

237. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

238. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

239. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

**(2) Tyson**

240. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

241. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.



242. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

243. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

**(3) JBS**

244. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

245. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

246. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

**(4) Hormel**

247. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

248. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

249. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

**(5) Seaboard**

250. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

251. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

252. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

253. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

254. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

255. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

256. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

257. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

**(6) Triumph**

258. Triumph admits that Christensen Farms is a member of Triumph. Triumph states that the two cited sources are the best evidence of their contents and speak for themselves, and Triumph denies all allegations relating to or purporting to describe them. Triumph denies the remaining allegations in this paragraph.

**(7) Clemens**

259. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

260. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

**(8) Co-Conspirators Indiana Packers**

261. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

262. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

263. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

**B. Timeline of the Conspiracy**

264. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

265. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

266. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

267. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

268. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

269. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

270. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

271. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

272. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

273. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

274. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

275. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

276. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

277. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

278. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

279. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

280. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

281. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

282. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

283. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

284. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

285. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

286. Triumph states that the public filing referenced in this paragraph speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

287. Triumph states that the alleged email and testimony referenced in this paragraph speak for themselves and are the best evidence of their contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

288. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

289. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

290. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

291. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

292. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

293. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

294. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

295. Triumph states that the public filing referenced in this paragraph speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

296. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' general characterizations of their claims, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

297. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

298. Triumph admits that it has a marketing agreement (predating the alleged conspiracy) with Seaboard under which hogs processed by Triumph are marketed by Seaboard. Triumph denies the allegations in the second and fourth sentences of this paragraph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies same.

299. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

300. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

301. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

302. Triumph states that the alleged article referenced in this paragraph speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents, and Triumph otherwise is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

303. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

304. Triumph states that the alleged testimony referenced in this paragraph speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

305. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

306. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

307. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

308. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

309. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

310. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

311. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

312. Triumph states that the alleged press release referenced in this paragraph speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

313. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

314. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

315. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.



316. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

317. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

318. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

319. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

320. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

321. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph and footnote pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

322. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

323. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

324. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

325. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

326. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

327. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

328. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

329. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

330. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

331. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

332. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

333. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

334. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

335. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

336. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

337. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

338. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

339. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

340. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

341. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

342. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

343. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

344. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

345. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

346. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

347. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

348. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

349. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

350. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

351. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

352. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

353. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

354. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

355. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

356. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

357. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

358. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

359. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

360. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

361. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

362. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

363. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

364. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

365. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

366. To the extent this paragraph alleges that Brad Freking is or was an employee of Triumph or represented Triumph during the conversation alleged herein, it is denied. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

367. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

368. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

369. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

**XII. ABNORMAL PRICING DURING THE CONSPIRACY DEMONSTRATES THE SUCCESS OF THE CONSPIRACY**

370. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

**(a) The Average Hog Wholesale Price Experienced an Unprecedented Increase Beginning in 2009**

371. Triumph states the USDA publications referenced in this paragraph speak for themselves and are the best evidence of their contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

372. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

**(b) The pork cut-out composite price experienced a dramatic increase in 2009 and continuing throughout the Conspiracy Period**

373. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

374. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

**(c) The Packer/Processor Defendants and Co-Conspirators' Revenues Increased Beginning in 2009, Even Taking Into Account Their Specific Costs**

375. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

376. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

377. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

378. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

**XIII. THE CONSPIRACY WAS EFFECTIVE IN INCREASING THE PRICE OF PORK SOLD TO PLAINTIFFS AND OTHERS IN THE UNITED STATES**

379. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

380. Triumph denies the allegations in the first and second sentences of this paragraph as unrealistic and simplistic. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

381. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

382. Triumph denies the last sentence of this paragraph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

383. Triumph states that the alleged Bureau of Labor Statistics data referenced in this paragraph speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

384. Triumph states that the alleged Bureau of Labor Statistics data referenced in this paragraph speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

385. Triumph states that the alleged Bureau of Labor Statistics data referenced in this paragraph speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

386. Triumph states that the alleged Bureau of Labor Statistics data referenced in this paragraph speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

387. Triumph states that the alleged Bureau of Labor Statistics data referenced in this paragraph speaks for itself and is the best evidence of its contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.



#### **XIV. PLAINTIFFS' CLAIMS ARE TIMELY**

##### **A. American Pipe Tolling**

388. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' general characterizations of their claims, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

389. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' general characterizations of their claims, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph denies the allegations in the last sentence of this paragraph. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the remaining allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

390. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' general characterizations of their claims, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

##### **B. Fraudulent Concealment**

391. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' general characterizations of their claims, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

392. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' general characterizations of their claims, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

393. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

394. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

395. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

396. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

397. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

398. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

399. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

400. Triumph denies all allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

401. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

402. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

403. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

404. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

405. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

406. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

407. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

408. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

409. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

410. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

411. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

412. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

413. Triumph denies any allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

414. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

415. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

416. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

417. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

418. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

419. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

420. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

421. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

422. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

423. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

424. Triumph denies all allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

425. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

426. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

427. Triumph states that the complaints referenced in this paragraph speak for themselves and are the best evidence of their contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

428. Triumph states the alleged article, complaint, and public filings referenced in this paragraph speak for themselves and are the best evidence of their contents, and Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

429. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

430. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

431. Triumph denies all allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

432. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

433. Triumph denies that it could “identify individual firm information in the Agri Stats reports.” Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

434. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

435. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

436. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

437. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

438. Triumph is without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

439. Triumph denies all allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

440. Triumph denies all allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

441. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

442. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

443. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph, including that a conspiracy existed at all, much less was not “disbanded.”

444. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs’ general characterizations of its claims, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

445. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs’ general characterizations of its claims, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

446. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' general characterizations of its claims, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

447. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' general characterizations of its claims, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

448. Triumph lacks sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

449. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' general characterizations of its claims, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

## **XV. CLAIMS FOR RELIEF AND CAUSES OF ACTION**

450. Triumph incorporates by reference its responses in the preceding paragraphs.

### **COUNT I – VIOLATION OF 15 U.S.C. § 1**

451. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' characterizations of case law and the Sherman Act, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph admits that the allegations in this paragraph quote a portion of the language from *Northern Pac. Ry. Co. v. United States*, 356 U.S. 1, 4 (1958) and *NCAA v. Alston*, 141 S. Ct. 2141, 2144 (2021). Triumph states that these cases, and the Sherman Act itself, speak for themselves and are the best evidence of their contents, and Triumph refers to the entirety of the cases and the Sherman Act for their contents and meaning.

452. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' characterizations of case law and the Sherman Act, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is

required, Triumph admits that the allegations in this paragraph quote a portion of the language from *Business Elecs. Corp. v. Sharp Elecs. Corp.*, 485 U.S. 717, 731-32 (1988) and *Mandeville Island Farms v. Am. Crystal Sugar Co.*, 334 U.S. 219, 236 (1948). Triumph states that these cases, and the Sherman Act itself, speak for themselves and are the best evidence of their contents, and Triumph refers to the entirety of the cases and the Sherman Act for their contents and meaning.

453. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' characterizations of case law and the Sherman Act, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph admits that the allegations in this paragraph quote portions of the language from *United States v. Socony-Vacuum Oil Co.*, 310 U.S. 150, 222 (1940) and *Apex Hosiery Co. v. Leader*, 310 U.S. 469, 495, 497 (1940). Triumph states that these cases, and the Sherman Act itself, speak for themselves and are the best evidence of their contents, and Triumph refers to the entirety of the cases and the Sherman Act for their contents and meaning.

454. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

455. Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

456. Triumph denies all allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

457. Triumph denies all allegations in this paragraph pertaining to Triumph. Triumph is otherwise without sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.



458. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' recitation of the purported elements of their claims, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

459. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' recitation of the purported elements of their claims, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

### **COUNT II – VIOLATION OF THE PACKERS AND STOCKYARD ACT**

460. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' characterizations of case law and the Packers and Stockyards Act, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph denies that Plaintiffs' characterization of the Packers and Stockyards Act is accurate and complete. Triumph states that these cases, and the Packers and Stockyards Act itself, speak for themselves and are the best evidence of their contents, and Triumph refers to the entirety of the cases and the Packers and Stockyards Act for their contents and meaning. Triumph denies that the Packers and Stockyards Act provides DAPs with a private right of action. Triumph denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

461. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' recitation of the purported elements of their claims, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph is without sufficient information to admit or deny the allegations in this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

462. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' characterizations of the Packers and Stockyards Act, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph refers to the entirety of this section and the Packers and Stockyards Act as a whole for their contents and meaning. Triumph denies any further allegations in this paragraph.

463. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' characterizations of the Packers and Stockyards Act and its enacting regulations, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph admits that the allegations in this paragraph quote portions of 9 C.F.R. § 201.69, and Triumph refers to the entirety of the regulation and the Packers and Stockyards Act as a whole for their contents and meaning.

464. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' characterizations of the Packers and Stockyards Act and its enacting regulations, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph admits that the allegations in this paragraph quote portions of 9 C.F.R. § 201.70, and Triumph refers to the entirety of the regulation and the Packers and Stockyards Act as a whole for their contents and meaning.

465. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' characterizations of the Packers and Stockyards Act and its enacting regulations, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

466. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' recitation of the purported elements of their claims, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

467. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' recitation of the purported elements of their claims, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

468. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' recitation of the purported elements of their claims, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

469. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' recitation of the purported elements of their claims, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

470. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' characterizations of the Packers and Stockyards Act, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph admits that the allegations in this paragraph purport to paraphrase portions of 7 U.S.C. § 209, and Triumph refers to the entirety of the section and the Packers and Stockyards Act as a whole for its contents and meaning.

471. This paragraph contains legal conclusions and/or Plaintiffs' recitation of the purported elements of their claims, such that no response is required, but to the extent a response is required, Triumph denies the allegations in this paragraph.

#### **XVI. PRAYER FOR RELIEF**

A. Triumph denies that Plaintiffs are entitled to any of the relief sought herein or otherwise.

B. Triumph denies that Plaintiffs are entitled to any of the relief sought herein or otherwise.

C. Triumph denies that Plaintiffs are entitled to any of the relief sought herein or otherwise.

D. Triumph denies that Plaintiffs are entitled to any of the relief sought herein or otherwise.

#### **XVII. JURY TRIAL DEMANDED**

Triumph demands a jury trial on issues so triable.

### **AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES**

Triumph states the following defenses to the claims against Triumph in Direct Action Plaintiffs' Consolidated Complaint, Dkt. 1659.

1. Plaintiffs' complaint fails to state a claim upon which relief may be granted.
2. To the extent Plaintiffs seek compensatory damages, penalties, punitive damages, exemplary damages, attorneys' fees and expenses, and other monetary relief from Triumph, any such recovery is so grossly excessive and inequitable that it would violate the Due Process Clause of the Fifth and Fourteenth Amendments of the United States Constitution.
3. Triumph has not engaged in any behavior that it knew or could reasonably have foreseen would ever be found to be improper under the federal law alleged by Plaintiffs, and therefore neither actual nor treble damages may be awarded against Triumph.
4. Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, by the applicable statute of limitations.
5. Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, by the doctrines of laches, estoppel, and waiver. Most, if not all, of Triumph's alleged conduct was public well before these Plaintiffs or any others in these consolidated actions filed their complaints. Plaintiffs demonstrated an unreasonable lack of diligence in bringing their claims, resulting in economic and legal prejudice to Triumph. Plaintiffs' unreasonable lack of diligence in raising their claims bars them now. Additionally, Plaintiffs' conduct in continuing to purchase pork products under a system of allegedly artificially inflated pricing long after Plaintiffs claim to have discovered such conspiracy is evidence of Plaintiffs' waiver of any right to bring suit. Plaintiffs' conduct was, and continues to be, inconsistent with any intention other than to waive their right to bring suit.

6. To the extent Plaintiff claims that Triumph fraudulently concealed any actions, Plaintiff has not alleged such fraud with the particularity required by Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 9(b).

7. Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, because any alleged anti-competitive effects of the conduct alleged by Plaintiffs do not outweigh the pro-competitive benefits.

8. Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, because the conduct of Triumph was procompetitive, reasonable, and permissible, and was based upon independent, legitimate, and self-interested business and economic justifications.

9. Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, because Triumph's conduct did not cause harm to competition in any relevant market.

10. Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, because any contracts or agreements between Triumph and any other person were lawful business arrangements and cannot support a claim that Triumph engaged in any unlawful conspiracy.

11. Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, because they did not suffer any injury in fact and/or any antitrust injury.

12. Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, because Plaintiffs' claimed injuries and damages were not legally or proximately caused by any act or omission of Triumph. For example, Triumph does not own sow herds and never has owned sow herds, and Triumph therefore did not reduce sow herds as Plaintiffs allege. Triumph also is party to a marketing agreement with another Defendant through which that Defendant markets and sells all at-issue pork products that Triumph produces. Plaintiffs' allegations on these and other points are false.

and Triumph has engaged in no conduct capable of legally or proximately causing Plaintiffs' claimed injuries and damages.

13. Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, because to the extent Plaintiffs suffered any injury or incurred any damages as alleged in the Complaint—which Triumph denies—any such injury or damage was caused and brought about by intervening or superseding events, factors, occurrences, conditions, or acts of others, including forces in the marketplace or swine diseases, and not by the alleged wrongful conduct on the part of Triumph and any recovery should be precluded.

14. Plaintiffs are precluded from recovering damages, in whole or in part, because and to the extent of their failure to mitigate alleged damages, if any. Plaintiffs allege a conspiracy involving different purportedly anticompetitive actions at different times, among a varying subset of the nation's pork producers. If Plaintiffs believed at any time that Defendants were unfairly and anti-competitively raising prices for their direct purchases through the use of Agri Stats and by conspiring at trade forums, for approximately nine years or more before filing their Original Complaints, Plaintiffs had an obligation to use their purchasing position to contract for or otherwise negotiate competitive terms of purchase or to switch to pork integrators that are not alleged to have been part of the alleged conspiracy, including but not limited to those that process specialty pork such as organic, pasture-raised and/or locally-sourced pork.

15. Plaintiffs' damages claims are barred, in whole or in part, because they have suffered no damages or because the damages they seek are speculative and uncertain.

16. Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, because Triumph did not act at all in the ways alleged in furtherance of the claimed conspiracy, much less take any such actions knowingly, willfully, or intentionally. For example, Triumph does not own sow herds and never

“reduced” its sow herds. As another example, Triumph does not market, sell, or export at-issue pork products it produces, and therefore did not increase exports to somehow allegedly influence the U.S. pork market.

17. To the extent Plaintiffs have engaged in unconscionable, bad faith, or other actions that would preclude or limit part or all of their claims or remedies, Plaintiffs’ claims are barred, in whole or in part, by the doctrines of *in pari delicto* and/or unclean hands. For example, given Plaintiffs’ allegations concerning Agri Stas, to the extent Plaintiffs themselves used Agri Stats that use of the same benchmarking service Plaintiffs claim was used as a conspiratorial tool should preclude or limit part or all of their claims or remedies. Further, to the extent Plaintiffs claim that receiving market information from customers is a conspiratorial act, Plaintiffs’ own acts of, inter alia, obtaining such market information in the conduct of their own business, or sharing or purporting to share information from one Defendant with another Defendant or pork producer, Plaintiffs’ claims or remedies should be barred or limited.

18. Without admitting the existence of any contract, combination or conspiracy in restraint of trade, and expressly denying same, Plaintiffs’ claims are barred, in whole or in part, by Triumph’s right to set off any amounts paid to Plaintiffs by any Defendants other than Triumph who have settled, or do settle, Plaintiffs’ claims against them in these or related actions.

19. Plaintiffs’ claims are barred, in whole or in part, to the extent it seeks improper multiple damage awards, damage awards duplicative of those sought in other actions, or excessive damages in violation of the Due Process guarantees of the Fifth and Fourteenth Amendments of the United States Constitution.

20. Plaintiffs' claims are barred to the extent that Plaintiffs seek recovery for damages resulting from indirect purchases of pork or, in the alternative, such claims are barred in whole or in part by the pass-on defense.

21. Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, to the extent that they have agreed to arbitration or chosen a different forum for the resolution of their claims. Plaintiffs' claims against Triumph and other defendants are premised on the sale of pork products. For any Plaintiffs that have contracts that contain arbitration clauses, those provisions may bar Plaintiffs' claims in this Court in whole or in part.

22. Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, to the extent Plaintiffs seek to impose liability on Triumph based on the exercise of any person or entity's right to petition federal, state and local legislative bodies, because such conduct was immune under the Noerr- Pennington doctrine and privileged under the First Amendment to the U.S. Constitution. To the extent that Plaintiffs seek to prove the existence of their alleged conspiracy by citing to lobbying and other protected activity, their claims are barred. See, e.g., Sysco Compl. ¶ 14 (citing to Defendants' alleged participation in "Legislative Action conferences each spring and fall in Washington DC"). Protected activities include, without limitation, participation in trade associations, seeking legislative and administrative remedies and lobbying activities related to the establishment of rules and procedures for USDA price or production reporting and the effect of ethanol requirements on grain prices.

#### **RESERVATION OF RIGHTS TO ASSERT ADDITIONAL DEFENSES**

Triumph has not knowingly or intentionally waived any applicable defenses, and it reserves the right to assert and rely upon other applicable defenses that may become available or apparent as this matter proceeds, including any defense previously asserted by Triumph, or any



defenses asserted by another Defendant of which Plaintiffs had notice. Triumph reserves the right to further amend or seek to amend its affirmative defenses.

Dated: ~~January 20~~March, 2023

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Christopher A. Smith

Aaron Chapin (#0386606)

Christopher A. Smith (*pro hac vice*)

Tessa K. Jacob (*pro hac vice*)

A. James Spung (*pro hac vice*)

Jason Husgen (*pro hac vice*)

Sarah L. Zimmerman (MDL registered)

Kate Ledden (MDL registered)

Tanner Cook (MDL registered)

Jacob N. Reinig (MDL registered)

HUSCH BLACKWELL LLP

190 Carondelet Plaza, Ste 600

St. Louis, MO 63105

Telephone: (314) 480-1500

aaron.chapin@huschblackwell.com

chris.smith@huschblackwell.com

tessa.jacob@huschblackwell.com

james.spung@huschblackwell.com

jason.husgen@huschblackwell.com

sarah.zimmerman@huschblackwell.com

kate.ledden@huschblackwell.com

tanner.cook@huschblackwell.com

jake.reinig@huschblackwell.com

*Counsel for Triumph Foods, LLC*